

**HUMAN RESOURCE DEPARTMENT  
EMPLOYMENT SERVICES DIVISION  
AUDIT 17-09  
August 31, 2017**



# CITY OF TAMPA

Bob Buckhorn, Mayor

Internal Audit Department

Christine Glover, Internal Audit Director

August 31, 2017

Honorable Bob Buckhorn  
Mayor, City of Tampa  
1 City Hall Plaza  
Tampa, Florida

RE: Employment Services Division Audit 17-09

Dear Mayor Buckhorn:

Attached is the Internal Audit Department's report on Human Resource Department, Employment Services Division Audit.

The Employment Services Division has already taken positive actions in response to our recommendations. We thank the aforementioned management and staff for their cooperation and assistance during this audit.

Sincerely,

/s/ Christine Glover  
Internal Audit Director

cc: Dennis Rogero, Chief of Staff  
Sonya Little, Chief Financial Officer  
Ernest Mueller, Chief Assistant City Attorney  
Kimberly Crum, Director of Human Resource  
Mike Swain, Employment Services Manager

**HUMAN RESOURCE DEPARTMENT  
EMPLOYMENT SERVICES DIVISION  
AUDIT 17-09  
August 31, 2017**

*/s/ Anthony D. Tiwari*

---

Auditor

*/s/ Christine Glover*

---

Audit Director

**HUMAN RESOURCE DEPARTMENT  
EMPLOYMENT SERVICES DIVISION  
AUDIT 17-09  
August 31, 2017**

**BACKGROUND**

The Employment Services Division (Division), a division of Human Resources, performs the personnel hiring function for City of Tampa (City) departments. In FY16 the City hired 337 qualified employees, both full-time and part-time, into 18 diverse departments.

The Division's duties include posting approved vacancies from departments, registering new applicants seeking employment, then screening and referring qualified individuals. Service delivery is accomplished by a team of seven full-time employees, including one manager that allocates the workload by City departments to specialists. Each specialist is assigned a department to focus on their specific recruitment needs. The team executes critical functions of the hiring process coordinated with the hiring departments, in order to maintain the City's comprehensive classification hiring plan, for approximately 600 classes of work.

In comparison to other municipalities, the City's hiring process is governed by overarching state laws, ordinances and labor agreements. The intricacies of the hiring process are supported by the use of technology. The City's Technology and Innovation Department developed "App Track", previously used by the Division to track the work flow process from applicants to new hires. The former application functioned as a database which required various manual processes. In March 2016, the web based application known as "JobAps" was implemented into production to supersede "App Track" in order to allow auditability, improve timeliness, and track applicant's progress in real time.

**STATEMENT OF OBJECTIVES**

This audit was conducted in accordance with the Internal Audit Department's FY17 Audit Agenda. The objectives of the audit were to:

1. Evaluate the timeliness of hiring employees across various job classifications and City departments using current processes.
2. Assess the adequacy of the system of internal controls related to certifying and hiring employees.

**STATEMENT OF SCOPE**

The audit period covered the hiring cycle for FY16. Both qualitative and quantitative assessments were performed to determine whether the management and staff of the Division were fulfilling their stated duties and responsibilities in an effective and efficient manner. Original records as well as copies were used as evidence and verified through observation and physical examination.

## **STATEMENT OF METHODOLOGY**

We achieved our audit objectives by utilizing the following methods:

1. Performed a data reliability assessment over the system generated reports that management uses as part of their controls.
2. Evaluated the design effectiveness of controls over processes governing the hiring cycle.
3. Reviewed applicable hiring standards, internal policies and procedures for completeness and compliance.
4. Interviewed key personnel to determine whether adequate controls over the hiring process had been established.
5. Analyzed a random sample from the population of active personnel hired in FY16 to determine the operating effectiveness of internal controls.

Using a sampling calculator, the random sample was based on the criteria of 90% confidence and 10% error rate, used in order to infer the results of the sample testing to the population generated from the Oracle Human Resource module. When appropriate, judgmental sampling was used to improve the overall efficiency of the audit.

We conducted a survey to provide feedback and offer management insight into their current processes from the perspective of the hiring managers served. The Survey Monkey<sup>®</sup> online medium provided the opportunity for confidential and candid responses, as opposed to an interview, which might have generated responses that were socially appropriate. We reviewed feedback from 69 individuals within hiring departments, and then summarized the results. The responses were provided to management to facilitate future development, which allows the Division to focus on needs and leverage its strengths.

## **STATEMENT OF AUDITING STANDARDS**

We conducted this performance audit in accordance with generally accepted government auditing standards. Those standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, appropriate evidence to provide a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives. We believe that the evidence obtained provides a reasonable basis for our findings and conclusions based on our audit objectives.

## **NOTEWORTHY ACCOMPLISHMENTS**

In an effort to improve timeliness and keep up with hiring demand, the Division has implemented the use of technology specifically geared toward managing and tracking the hiring process. They have increased the number of specialists to improve the process of certifying applicants and currently working toward replacement of the manual assessment processes with the use of evaluation software.

## **AUDIT CONCLUSIONS**

Based upon the test work performed and the audit findings noted below, our conclusions are as follows:

1. The timeliness of hiring employees across various job classifications appears to be adequate. However, it is noted that timeliness improved with JobAps and the Division is continuing to take steps to make improvements in timeliness.
2. An adequate system of internal controls exists for certifying and hiring employees. However the Division's existing documented processes are in need of an update and expansion to provide better direction to staff on how daily operations should be carried out.

## **POLICIES AND PROCEDURES**

**STATEMENT OF CONDITION:** The Division is responsible for registering applicants seeking employment; posting available openings from department managers then screening and referring qualified applicants. The Division's current processes are in need of an update to better document carrying out routine daily operations.

**CRITERIA:** The City's Municipal Code Section 2-46, requires departments to create and maintain, among other things, proper documentation of their functions, policies and procedures. Also, documented policies and/or SOP's are useful and effective not only for retention of an organization's operational knowledge and new employee training, but also for reliable internal control.

**CAUSE:** Institutional knowledge from experienced employees have been relied upon to provide guidance on the performance of day-to-day responsibilities. Daily operations took priority over the development of policies and standard operating procedures.

**EFFECT OF CONDITION:** Without documented policies and/SOP's, there is likely to be inconsistency in the way processes and procedures are carried out. Training of new employees is likely to be affected, resulting in their productivity and efficiency being negatively impacted. There is also an elevated dependence on institutional knowledge, which is a risky situation considering the possibility of staff separation from the Division. Ultimately, the effectiveness of the internal control system could be compromised.

**RECOMMENDATION:** The Division should document policies and/or SOP's to reflect current practice as well as encapsulate contemporary statutory requirements for compliance.

**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE:** Federal and state laws, Civil Service Rules and the Personnel Manual are policies currently in place which govern a significant portion of how the Employment Services Division operates. Recent implementation of new systems such as Oracle, JobAps and related Standard Operating Procedures, has created challenges with using former procedures in light of automation. New processes are developed as staff continues to discover and explore system features to determine modifications necessary since the system was launched. It is agreed that additional processes and procedures should be implemented and some current processes should be updated to ensure consistency. The following processes are currently documented: employment process, background process, pre-employment testing, drug screen scheduling, education equivalents and temporary staffing. In addition, online training resources are available for JobAps users and supervisors.

**TARGET IMPLEMENTATION DATE:** 12/31/2017. Processes for seasonal hiring, promotional testing, matrix promotions and JobAps for ES staff should be in place by this date. Additional processes will continue to be developed and current processes will be updated with a completion goal of June 2018.